COR/2018/00109

February 5, 2018

Dear [Redacted]

Re: Your request for access to information under Part II of the Access to Information and Protection of Privacy Act (Our File: TW/144/2017)

On November 29, 2017, the Department of Transportation and Works received your request for access to the following records:

Any and all correspondence, including briefing materials or reports, to or from the minister or deputy minister referencing the St. Brendan's ferry service for 2017.

I am pleased to inform you that a decision has been made by the Deputy Minister of Transportation and Works to provide access to some of the requested information.

Access to the remaining records, and/or information contained within the records, has been refused in accordance with the following exceptions to disclosure, as specified in the Access to Information and Protection of Privacy Act (the Act):

Subsection 29(1)(a) - The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information that would reveal advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options developed by or for a public body or minister

Subsection 35(1)(c) - The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information which could reasonably be expected to disclose plans that relate to the management of personnel of or the administration of a public body and that have not yet been implemented or made public;

Subsection 40(1) - The head of a public body shall refuse to disclose personal information to an applicant where the disclosure would be an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy.

P.O. Box 8700, St. John’s, NL, Canada, A1B 4J6
As required by 8(2) of the Act, we have severed information that is unable to be disclosed and have provided you with as much information as possible. In accordance with your request for a copy of the records, the appropriate copies have been enclosed.

Please be advised that you may appeal this decision and ask the Information and Privacy Commissioner to review the decision to provide partial access to the requested information, as set out in section 42 of the Act (a copy of this section of the Act has been enclosed for your reference). A request to the Commissioner must be made in writing within 15 business days of the date of this letter or within a longer period that may be allowed by the Commissioner. Your appeal should identify your concerns with the request and why you are submitting the appeal.

The appeal may be addressed to the Information and Privacy Commissioner is as follows:

Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner
2 Canada Drive
P. O. Box 13004, Stn. A
St. John’s, NL. A1B 3V8
Telephone: (709) 729-6309
Toll-Free: 1-877-729-6309
Facsimile: (709) 729-6500

You may also appeal directly to the Supreme Court Trial Division within 15 business days after you receive the decision of the public body, pursuant to section 52 of the Act (a copy of this section of the Act has been enclosed for your reference).

Please be advised that responsive records will be published following a 72 hour period after the response is sent electronically to you or five business days in the case where records are mailed to you. It is the goal to have the responsive records posted to the Completed Access to Information Requests website within one business day following the applicable period of time. Please note that requests for personal information will not be posted online.

If you have any further questions, please contact me by telephone at (709) 729-5303 or by email at Deanne Adams@gov.nl.ca.

Sincerely,

[Signature]

Deanne Adams
ATIPP Coordinator
Department of Transportation and Works
Enclosures
Policy advice or recommendations

29. (1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information that would reveal

(a) advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options developed by or for a public body or minister;

(b) the contents of a formal research report or audit report that in the opinion of the head of the public body is incomplete and in respect of which a request or order for completion has been made by the head within 65 business days of delivery of the report; or

(c) draft legislation or regulations.

(2) The head of a public body shall not refuse to disclose under subsection (1)

(a) factual material;

(b) a public opinion poll;

(c) a statistical survey;

(d) an appraisal;

(e) an environmental impact statement or similar information;

(f) a final report or final audit on the performance or efficiency of a public body or on any of its programs or policies;

(g) a consumer test report or a report of a test carried out on a product to test equipment of the public body;

(h) a feasibility or technical study, including a cost estimate, relating to a policy or project of the public body;

(i) a report on the results of field research undertaken before a policy proposal is formulated;

(j) a report of an external task force, committee, council or similar body that has been established to consider a matter and make a report or recommendations to a public body;

(k) a plan or proposal to establish a new program or to change a program, if the plan or proposal has been approved or rejected by the head of the public body;

(l) information that the head of the public body has cited publicly as the basis for making a decision or formulating a policy; or
(m) a decision, including reasons, that is made in the exercise of a discretionary power or an adjudicative function and that affects the rights of the applicant.

(3) Subsection (1) does not apply to information in a record that has been in existence for 15 years or more.

**Disclosure harmful to the financial or economic interests of a public body**

35. (1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information which could reasonably be expected to disclose

(a) trade secrets of a public body or the government of the province;

(b) financial, commercial, scientific or technical information that belongs to a public body or to the government of the province and that has, or is reasonably likely to have, monetary value;

(c) plans that relate to the management of personnel of or the administration of a public body and that have not yet been implemented or made public;

(d) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to result in the premature disclosure of a proposal or project or in significant loss or gain to a third party;

(e) scientific or technical information obtained through research by an employee of a public body, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to deprive the employee of priority of publication;

(f) positions, plans, procedures, criteria or instructions developed for the purpose of contractual or other negotiations by or on behalf of the government of the province or a public body, or considerations which relate to those negotiations;

(g) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to prejudice the financial or economic interest of the government of the province or a public body; or

(h) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to be injurious to the ability of the government of the province to manage the economy of the province.

(2) The head of a public body shall not refuse to disclose under subsection (1) the results of product or environmental testing carried out by or for that public body, unless the testing was done

(a) for a fee as a service to a person or a group of persons other than the public body; or

(b) for the purpose of developing methods of testing.
Disclosure harmful to personal privacy

40. (1) The head of a public body shall refuse to disclose personal information to an applicant where the disclosure would be an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy.

(2) A disclosure of personal information is not an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy where

(a) the applicant is the individual to whom the information relates;

(b) the third party to whom the information relates has, in writing, consented to or requested the disclosure;

(c) there are compelling circumstances affecting a person’s health or safety and notice of disclosure is given in the form appropriate in the circumstances to the third party to whom the information relates;

(d) an Act or regulation of the province or of Canada authorizes the disclosure;

(e) the disclosure is for a research or statistical purpose and is in accordance with section 70;

(f) the information is about a third party's position, functions or remuneration as an officer, employee or member of a public body or as a member of a minister's staff;

(g) the disclosure reveals financial and other details of a contract to supply goods or services to a public body;

(h) the disclosure reveals the opinions or views of a third party given in the course of performing services for a public body, except where they are given in respect of another individual;

(i) public access to the information is provided under the Financial Administration Act;

(j) the information is about expenses incurred by a third party while travelling at the expense of a public body;

(k) the disclosure reveals details of a licence, permit or a similar discretionary benefit granted to a third party by a public body, not including personal information supplied in support of the application for the benefit;

(l) the disclosure reveals details of a discretionary benefit of a financial nature granted to a third party by a public body, not including

   (i) personal information that is supplied in support of the application for the benefit, or
(ii) personal information that relates to eligibility for income and employment support under the Income and Employment Support Act or to the determination of income or employment support levels; or

(m) the disclosure is not contrary to the public interest as described in subsection (3) and reveals only the following personal information about a third party:

(i) attendance at or participation in a public event or activity related to a public body, including a graduation ceremony, sporting event, cultural program or club, or field trip, or

(ii) receipt of an honour or award granted by or through a public body.

(3) The disclosure of personal information under paragraph (2)(m) is an unreasonable invasion of personal privacy where the third party whom the information is about has requested that the information not be disclosed.

(4) A disclosure of personal information is presumed to be an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy where

(a) the personal information relates to a medical, psychiatric or psychological history, diagnosis, condition, treatment or evaluation;

(b) the personal information is an identifiable part of a law enforcement record, except to the extent that the disclosure is necessary to dispose of the law enforcement matter or to continue an investigation;

(c) the personal information relates to employment or educational history;

(d) the personal information was collected on a tax return or gathered for the purpose of collecting a tax;

(e) the personal information consists of an individual's bank account information or credit card information;

(f) the personal information consists of personal recommendations or evaluations, character references or personnel evaluations;

(g) the personal information consists of the third party's name where

(i) it appears with other personal information about the third party, or

(ii) the disclosure of the name itself would reveal personal information about the third party; or

(h) the personal information indicates the third party's racial or ethnic origin or religious or political beliefs or associations.
(5) In determining under subsections (1) and (4) whether a disclosure of personal information constitutes an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy, the head of a public body shall consider all the relevant circumstances, including whether

(a) the disclosure is desirable for the purpose of subjecting the activities of the province or a public body to public scrutiny;

(b) the disclosure is likely to promote public health and safety or the protection of the environment;

(c) the personal information is relevant to a fair determination of the applicant's rights;

(d) the disclosure will assist in researching or validating the claims, disputes or grievances of aboriginal people;

(e) the third party will be exposed unfairly to financial or other harm;

(f) the personal information has been supplied in confidence;

(g) the personal information is likely to be inaccurate or unreliable;

(h) the disclosure may unfairly damage the reputation of a person referred to in the record requested by the applicant;

(i) the personal information was originally provided to the applicant; and

(j) the information is about a deceased person and, if so, whether the length of time the person has been deceased indicates the disclosure is not an unreasonable invasion of the deceased person’s personal privacy.
Access or correction complaint

42. (1) A person who makes a request under this Act for access to a record or for correction of personal information may file a complaint with the commissioner respecting a decision, act or failure to act of the head of the public body that relates to the request.

(2) A complaint under subsection (1) shall be filed in writing not later than 15 business days

   (a) after the applicant is notified of the decision of the head of the public body, or the date of the act or failure to act; or

   (b) after the date the head of the public body is considered to have refused the request under subsection 16 (2).

(3) A third party informed under section 19 of a decision of the head of a public body to grant access to a record or part of a record in response to a request may file a complaint with the commissioner respecting that decision.

(4) A complaint under subsection (3) shall be filed in writing not later than 15 business days after the third party is informed of the decision of the head of the public body.

(5) The commissioner may allow a longer time period for the filing of a complaint under this section.

(6) A person or third party who has appealed directly to the Trial Division under subsection 52 (1) or 53 (1) shall not file a complaint with the commissioner.

(7) The commissioner shall refuse to investigate a complaint where an appeal has been commenced in the Trial Division.

(8) A complaint shall not be filed under this section with respect to

   (a) a request that is disregarded under section 21;

   (b) a decision respecting an extension of time under section 23;

   (c) a variation of a procedure under section 24; or

   (d) an estimate of costs or a decision not to waive a cost under section 26.

(9) The commissioner shall provide a copy of the complaint to the head of the public body concerned.
Direct appeal to Trial Division by an applicant

52. (1) Where an applicant has made a request to a public body for access to a record or correction of personal information and has not filed a complaint with the commissioner under section 42, the applicant may appeal the decision, act or failure to act of the head of the public body that relates to the request directly to the Trial Division.

(2) An appeal shall be commenced under subsection (1) not later than 15 business days after the applicant is notified of the decision of the head of the public body, or the date of the act or failure to act; or

(b) after the date the head of the public body is considered to have refused the request under subsection 16 (2).

(3) Where an applicant has filed a complaint with the commissioner under section 42 and the commissioner has refused to investigate the complaint, the applicant may commence an appeal in the Trial Division of the decision, act or failure to act of the head of the public body that relates to the request for access to a record or for correction of personal information.

(4) An appeal shall be commenced under subsection (3) not later than 15 business days after the applicant is notified of the commissioner’s refusal under subsection 45 (2).
Hello Minister Hawkins,

My name is Natasha Aylward and I am the Administrator of St. Gabriel's All-Grade School, St. Brendan's. We will be having our Graduation ceremony on the evening of May 19th, 2017. I am contacting you to see if it is possible for the ferry to make an extra trip the night of the Graduation to accommodate dignitaries who will be in attendance for the ceremony. Unfortunately, there aren't any accommodations on the island and so if an extra trip is not permitted we will lose out on our guest speaker president if the NLTA, legion representatives and possibly attendance from others who intend to support and celebrate the academic success of our graduating class.

I believe Mr Colin Holloway has been working trying to accommodate our current need.

If at all possible a prompt response would be greatly appreciated as we will have to let these dignitaries know in advance. As you can appreciate this is a huge event for a small community. Thank you in advance!

Natasha Aylward
Admin St. Gabriel's All Grade, St. Brendan's NL

Sent from my iPhone
Hello Miss Fancey & Mr Hawkins,

My Name is Natasha Aylward and I am the Administrator of St. Gabriel's All-Grade School, St. Brendan's. As you know, we are currently working toward a collective agreement around the operation of our ferry on the island. While I believe in the integrity of our Mayor and the current transportation committee, I also believe there is a need for a public meeting to review options being put forth by the government and understandings of those options by our council and transportation committee.

Mayor Broomfield multiple times and respect her passion for her community and her tenacity. Mr. Holloway and again respect his position and appreciate his workings to accommodate me in various aspects of schooling and community life. Recently a dispute between the two has made the island uneasy and the good people of St. Brendan’s do not want to be caught in the crossfire.

Mr Holloway will be attending the Graduation Ceremony on the island on Friday, transportation permitting and Mayor Broomfield will be present as well. As you can appreciate, this is not the time nor the place for disputes regarding transportation, when we are trying to celebrate the achievements of a student’s milestones. The miscommunications or lack of communication by all parties involved need to be dealt with at a public meeting, where all are present to then voice and address concerns.

I feel that if we promote a scheduled meeting, discussion of transportation issues will be kept for that said time. I believe Mr. Hollway and Mrs Broomfield have enough couth to not misuse their invitation to the graduation ceremonies for debate. However, when emotions are high and without a clear understanding by all participants, the possibility exist.

As a community we understand the current economic situation of our province and we are willing to work together to hash out a schedule that works for everyone. A public meeting would clarify any misconceptions and promote a willingness by government to work together.

Again, my intention here is not to go above anyone’s head or to downgrade anyone’s character or position. Rather, I am reaching out to nip the potential for aired frustrations in the bud and to promote a positive and working relationship between all stakeholders involved moving forward.
Should you wish to discuss further, please contact me. I am very approachable!

Sincerely,

Natasha Aylward

--

Natasha Aylward  B.Ed & M.Ed
nattashapowell@nlsec.ca
Admin, St. Gabriel's All-Grade School
St. Brendan's, NL
Phone: (709) 669-3331 Fax: (709) 669-5551

Confidentiality Warning: This message and any attachments are intended for the sole use of the intended recipient(s), and may contain privileged and/or confidential information. If you are not an intended recipient, any review, retransmission, conversion to hard copy, copying, circulation or other use of this message and any attachments is strictly prohibited. If you received this email in error, please delete the message and attachments immediately and notify the sender by return email. Thank you!

avis de confidentialité: Ce courriel, ainsi que tout renseignement ci-inclus, est destiné uniquement au(x) destinataire(s) susmentionné(s) et peut contenir de l’information confidentielle. Si vous n’êtes pas le destinataire prévu, tout examen, copie, impression, reproduction, distribution ou autre utilisation de ce courriel est strictement interdit. Si vous avez reçu ce message par erreur, veuillez en aviser immédiatement l’expéditeur par retour de ce courriel et veuillez supprimer immédiatement cette communication. Merci.
Waiting on parts and now parts are due here on Monday and technicians are scheduled to be onboard for 0800 Tuesday morning.

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.

Original Message
From: King, Tracy
Sent: Saturday, May 27, 2017 11:37 AM
To: Baker, John (TW)
Subject: RE: 2 trips today and Sunday

What's the status on repairs to the vessel?

Tracy King
Deputy Minister
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
(709)729-3676

“Avoid the worst. Put safety first”

-----Original Message-----
From: MV Grace Sparkes St. Brendan's
Sent: Saturday, May 27, 2017 7:38 AM
To: Service Update STB <ServiceUpdateSTB@gov.nl.ca>; [REDACTED]
Subject: 2 trips today and Sunday

Due to operating on one engine, for Saturday and Sunday we will depart St. Brendan's at 9 AM and 2 PM and depart Burnside at 1115 AM and 5 PM
Do you know when he's fitting it in?

Tracy King
Deputy Minister
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
(709)729-3676

The safe way is the only way

From: Tremblett, Glenn
Sent: Monday, July 3, 2017 13:58
To: King, Tracy; Baker, John (TW); Marshall, Shawn A; Cuff, Greg
Cc: Hawkins, Allan
Subject: Re: St. Brendan's ferry

Just spoke with captaon

He is doing extra trip

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.

From: King, Tracy
Sent: Monday, July 3, 2017 13:55
To: Baker, John (TW); Tremblett, Glenn; Marshall, Shawn A; Cuff, Greg
Cc: Hawkins, Allan
Subject: Fw: St. Brendan's ferry

Please see below and advise.

Tracy King
Deputy Minister
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
(709)729-3676

The safe way is the only way

From: Companion, Lori Anne <LoriAnneCompanion@gov.nl.ca>
Sent: Monday, July 3, 2017 13:14
To: King, Tracy
Subject: Fw: St. Brendan's ferry
Good afternoon....
I am hearing complaints about long lines of traffic waiting to cross on the St. Brendan's ferry. Is there anyway to have a load and go or extra crossings ordered until the traffic clears?

I look forward to hearing from someone on this.

Thank you
Paul

Paul Davis, MHA

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.
Thank you Tracy. It was greatly appreciated.

Paul

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.

We are adding an extra trip shortly that the captain feels should clear up any traffic issues.

Regards,
Tracy

Tracy King
Deputy Minister
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
(709)729-3676

The safe way is the only way

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.

Good afternoon....
I am hearing complaints about long lines of traffic waiting to cross on the St. Brendan’s ferry. Is there anyway to have a load and go or extra crossings ordered until the traffic clears?
I look forward to hearing from someone on this.

Thank you
Paul

Paul Davis, MHA

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.
Thanks very much Glenn.

Tracy

Tracy King
Deputy Minister
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
(709)729-3676

The safe way is the only way

The issue wasn't the number of vehicles but the size of the trucks.

They will put in an extra trip right now instead of waiting at St Brendan's and they have 2 dump trucks with crushed stone coming.

Vessel feels the extra trip now will clear up everything and they will be able to maintain very close to next scheduled departure

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.

Ok

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.

I will get clarification but from initial discussion with captain looks like an extra trip will benefit as there were fish trucks he was concerned with.
Was there increased traffic? Certainly not enough to warrant load and go?

Just spoke with captain.

He is doing extra trip.

Please see below and advise.

Tracy King
Deputy Minister
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
(709)729-3676

The safe way is the only way.

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.
Good afternoon....
I am hearing complaints about long lines of traffic waiting to cross on the St. Brendan's ferry. Is there anyway to have a load and go or extra crossings ordered until the traffic clears?

I look forward to hearing from someone on this.

Thank you
Paul

Paul Davis, MHA

Sent from my BlackBerry 10 smartphone on the Bell network.
Hi Greg,

If you would like to discuss further, please let me know.

Fiona
Greg

From: Ellis, Fiona  
Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2017 09:06 AM  
To: Cuff, Greg; Hurley, Carol F.; Baker, John (TW)  
Subject: RE: Bell Island/St Brendan's

Hi Greg,

It think it is fine as is to have the start times only for maintenance.

An FYI, the St. Brendan’s schedule says summer schedule on the bottom but winter schedule on the top.

Any questions, please let me know.

Fiona

From: Cuff, Greg  
Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2017 8:53 AM  
To: Ellis, Fiona <FionaEllis@gov.nl.ca>; Hurley, Carol F. <hurleyc@gov.nl.ca>; Baker, John (TW) <JBaker@gov.nl.ca>  
Subject: FW: Bell Island/St Brendan's

The Bell Island schedule had some departure times missing. Fiona/Carol for the maintenance is having the beginning on the maintenance period in the schedule fine or should the end time be there as well? It is currently spelled out at the bottom of the schedule with only the commencement times there. Bell Island said they would get back to us today concerning Flanders times on weekend. We removed the February portion of the St. Brennan’s schedule which shouldn’t
have been included.

Greg Cuff  
Director of Marine Services – Marine Services Division  
Department of Transportation & Works  
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador  
P.O. Box 97  
Lewisporte, NL  
A0G 3A0  
709-535-6210  
gregcuff@gov.nl.ca

From: Whiteway, Cynthia  
Sent: Wednesday, September 13, 2017 8:45 AM  
To: Tremblett, Glenn; Cuff, Greg  
Subject: Bell Island/St Brendan's

Good Morning,  
Attached are the updated schedules.  
Cindy

“This email and any attached files are intended for the sole use of the primary and copied addressee(s) and may contain privileged and/or confidential information. Any distribution, use or copying by any means of this information is strictly prohibited. If you received this email in error, please delete it immediately and notify the sender.”

“This email and any attached files are intended for the sole use of the primary and copied addressee(s) and may contain privileged and/or confidential information. Any distribution, use or copying by any means of this information is strictly prohibited. If you received this email in error, please delete it immediately and notify the sender.”
Thanks John. I think you should include the recent changes to the BI schedule.

Tracy King
Deputy Minister
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
(709)729-3676

“Avoid the worst. Put safety first”

From: Baker, John (TW)
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2017 12:32 PM
To: King, Tracy <TracyKing@gov.nl.ca>
Subject: FW: Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule Background Bullets

Bullets we have prepared for the Minister as requested.
If you are good, I will forward to him.

John

From: Martin, Kellee
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2017 11:59 AM
To: Baker, John (TW) <JBaker@gov.nl.ca>
Subject: Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule Background Bullets
Hi John,

As discussed, attached (and below) are the bullets outlining the background on the Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule.

Thanks,
Kellee

---

**Background on Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule**

- In 2016, the Government of Newfoundland and Labrador launched the Government Renewal Initiative, with a mandate to identify a combination of measures to increase revenues and reduce expenditures; eliminate waste and identify opportunities to do things better and more efficiently; assess the role of government in providing public services; and establish multi-year fiscal targets.

- One of the initiatives identified as part of the Government Renewal Initiative was changes to ferry schedules. The aim of this initiative was to reduce costs associated with the intraprovincial ferry services by reducing the number of trips on many of the intraprovincial ferry schedules, as the capacity of most services was significantly higher than traffic warranted.

- The intent of this initiative was to result in immediate fuel savings, as well as long-term savings associated with maintenance and refit due to less wear and tear on the vessels and more time for preventative maintenance.

- The new ferry schedules, developed as part of the Government Renewal Initiative, were implemented on October 21, 2016. The new schedules were developed based on input received from consultations with ferry user committees to help find efficiencies in service delivery and better align ferry services with passenger usage.

- New, reduced ferry schedules were implemented for the following services:
  - St. Brendan’s - Burnside
  - Gaultois - McCallum - Hermitage
  - Rencontre East - Bay L’Argent - Pool’s Cove
  - Francois - Grey River - Burgeo
  - Ramea - Grey River - Burgeo
  - South East Bight - Petite Forte
  - Little Bay Islands - Long Island - Pilley's Island

- The Bell Island service was excluded from schedule reductions, as TW was in the process of developing a new schedule to be implemented upon the entry of the MV Legionnaire into service.

- **The Fogo Island/Change Islands schedule was not reduced as part of the Government Renewal Initiative. In the case of Fogo Island/Change Islands, one additional round-trip per week was actually added to the Winter schedule, to be consistent with the Summer schedule for this service.**

- Since that time, it has been determined that the additional round-trip, which costs approximately $250,000 per year in overtime due to the crew call-outs required, is
underutilized. On average, this trip carries 15.3 passengers and 7.5 vehicles per trip. The capacity of the MV Veteran is 200 passengers and 64 vehicles. This represents 7.6% of the vessel’s passenger capacity and 11.7% of the vessel’s vehicle capacity.

----------------------------------------

Kellee Martin
Manager of Policy and Program Planning
Department of Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
P.O. Box 8700, St. John’s, NL A1B 4J6
Phone: 709-729-6560
Email: kellemartin@gov.nl.ca
From: King, Tracy  
To: Scott, Brian  
Cc: Crocker, Steve; Baker, John (TW); Drover, Rodney C; Worthman, Matthew  
Subject: Re: Approval for response to NTV on St. Brendan’s  
Date: Tuesday, October 31, 2017 1:05:27 PM  

Good.

Tracy King  
Deputy Minister  
Transportation and Works  
(709)729-3676

The safe way is the only way.

On Oct 31, 2017, at 1:04 PM, Scott, Brian <BrianScott@gov.nl.ca> wrote:

Hi Tracy and Minister, NTV has requested info for a story on St. Brendan’s. Questions and answers are below. John has approved. Nothing new since yesterday.

Heather Gillis  
NTV, St. John’s  
hgillis@ntv.ca

Inquiry:

Looking for some information on the Grace Sparkes.

- When did it start service?
- How much did the ship cost?
- How much does it cost to operate?
- How much are the ticket prices subsidized?  

Can I please have this information before 2:00?

Suggested Response:

The MV Grace Sparkes started service in 2011 on the St. Brendan’s – Burnside. The vessel was purchased for $30 million.

The cost to operate in the service in 2015-16 was $6.1 million, and the subsidization rate was 93.3%.
The annual operating cost and associated subsidization level varies each year depending on factors such as vessel refits and schedule changes.

**Brian Scott**  
Director of Communications  
Transportation and Works  
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador  
e: brianscott@gov.nl.ca  
t: 709.729.3015  
[www.tw.gov.nl.ca](http://www.tw.gov.nl.ca) | @TW_GovNL
Mayor Veronica Broomfield on Open Line re: St. Brendan’s:

- Says she doesn’t have much time to talk about her interview with CBC this morning.
- Says she just told it to Terry Roberts as it is.
- Says as for resettlement, her community isn’t going anywhere in the near future.

- Paddy says people are rightfully concerned with how province spends money. Asks what she would say to those people.

- Mayor Broomfield says government supports communities in other places.
- Says everybody in St. Brendan’s is working. Asks where would government place the community that would not cost money.

- Paddy asks at what point to we start the conversation about what’s next for these communities?

- Broomfield says she is not going out to ask people if they want to resettle.
- Says people there are quite snug and comfortable and own their own homes.
- Says they always used to have gas on the island, and when the gas stations went off the island, everyone thought it was the end of the community. But she says if you ask people there today, they say they don’t miss it.

- Paddy asks why not have the conversation about how people there feel about the $270,000 subsidy to relocate?

- Broomfield says that conversation has never been had there. Says she was part of a family that resettled and she knows what it’s all about.

- Paddy asks at some point are we going to be able to have these conversations without people getting so uptight about it.

- Broomfield says no. Says she remembers when her family had to resettle in 1960s. Says people are not coming to her asking about it.

- She says she invited CBC reporter into her house because she didn’t want him to go away and say she slammed the door in his face.
- Says she told him he should have come there in the summer when the community was busier.

- Paddy says Terry didn’t do anything wrong.
- Broomfield says no he did not, but St. Brendan’s is St. Brendan’s and the community will die off on its own.
- Says whenever she dies, she wants to be buried on the island next to her husband.
- Paddy says the conversation is coming and it will not be easy, but it is coming.
- Says we know that and it is why provincial leaders don’t talk about it.
- Says it is political suicide to talk about it.
- Says it takes leadership and a concern for the greater good.
- Says if we don’t deal with this issue now, if we are afraid of the actual, legitimately tricky political conversations (as opposed to the cyclical, routine annual ones), they it’s time to get someone in who isn’t afraid to have them.

---------------------------------------------------------------------

Rod Drover
Media Relations Manager
Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
rodneycdrover@gov.nl.ca
t: 709.729.1758| c: 709.730.4607
Tracy, bullet added, your thoughts please?

John

From: Martin, Kellee  
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2017 12:58 PM  
To: Baker, John (TW) <JBaker@gov.nl.ca>  
Subject: RE: Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule Background Bullets

Hi, Deputy feels that we should include a bullet re the Bi service whereby we reduced the number of trips by 5 and also we have further reduced the schedule on Sat and Sun for each vessel for maintenance.

John

From: Martin, Kellee  
Sent: Tuesday, October 17, 2017 11:59 AM  
To: Baker, John (TW) <JBaker@gov.nl.ca>  
Subject: Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule Background Bullets

Hi John,

As discussed, attached (and below) are the bullets outlining the background on the Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule.

Thanks,
Kellee

---

**Background on Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule**

- In 2016, the Government of Newfoundland and Labrador launched the Government Renewal Initiative, with a mandate to identify a combination of measures to increase revenues and reduce expenditures; eliminate waste and identify opportunities to do things better and more efficiently; assess the role of government in providing public services; and establish multi-year
fiscal targets.

- One of the initiatives identified as part of the Government Renewal Initiative was changes to ferry schedules. The aim of this initiative was to reduce costs associated with the intraprovincial ferry services by reducing the number of trips on many of the intraprovincial ferry schedules, as the capacity of most services was significantly higher than traffic warranted.

- The intent of this initiative was to result in immediate fuel savings, as well as long-term savings associated with maintenance and refit due to less wear and tear on the vessels and more time for preventative maintenance.

- The new ferry schedules, developed as part of the Government Renewal Initiative, were implemented on October 21, 2016. The new schedules were developed based on input received from consultations with ferry user committees to help find efficiencies in service delivery and better align ferry services with passenger usage.

- New, reduced ferry schedules were implemented for the following services:
  - St. Brendan's - Burnside
  - Gaultois - McCallum - Hermitage
  - Rencontre East - Bay L'Argent - Pool's Cove
  - Francois - Grey River - Burgeo
  - Ramea - Grey River - Burgeo
  - South East Bight - Petite Forte
  - Little Bay Islands - Long Island - Pilley's Island

- The Bell Island service was excluded from schedule reductions, as TW was in the process of developing a new schedule to be implemented upon the entry of the MV Legionnaire into service.

- The Fogo Island/Change Islands schedule was not reduced as part of the Government Renewal Initiative. In the case of Fogo Island/Change Islands, one additional round-trip per week was actually added to the Winter schedule, to be consistent with the Summer schedule for this service.

- Since that time, it has been determined that the additional round-trip, which costs approximately $250,000 per year in overtime due to the crew call-outs required, is underutilized. On average, this trip carries 15.3 passengers and 7.5 vehicles per trip. The capacity of the MV Veteran is 200 passengers and 64 vehicles. This represents 7.6% of the vessel’s passenger capacity and 11.7% of the vessel’s vehicle capacity.

---------------------------------------

Kellee Martin
Manager of Policy and Program Planning
Department of Transportation and Works
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador
P.O. Box 8700, St. John's, NL A1B 4J6
Phone: 709-729-6560
Email: kelleemartin@gov.nl.ca
Background on Fogo Island/Change Islands Schedule

- In 2016, the Government of Newfoundland and Labrador launched the Government Renewal Initiative, with a mandate to identify a combination of measures to increase revenues and reduce expenditures; eliminate waste and identify opportunities to do things better and more efficiently; assess the role of government in providing public services; and establish multi-year fiscal targets.

- One of the initiatives identified as part of the Government Renewal Initiative was changes to ferry schedules. The aim of this initiative was to reduce costs associated with the intraprovincial ferry services by reducing the number of trips on many of the intraprovincial ferry schedules, as the capacity of most services was significantly higher than traffic warranted.

- The intent of this initiative was to result in immediate fuel savings, as well as long-term savings associated with maintenance and refit due to less wear and tear on the vessels and more time for preventative maintenance.

- The new ferry schedules, developed as part of the Government Renewal Initiative, were implemented on October 21, 2016. The new schedules were developed based on input received from consultations with ferry user committees to help find efficiencies in service delivery and better align ferry services with passenger usage.

- New, reduced ferry schedules were implemented for the following services:
  - St. Brendan's - Burnside
  - Gaultois - McCallum - Hermitage
  - Rencontre East - Bay L'Argent - Pool's Cove
  - Francois - Grey River - Burgeo
  - Ramea - Grey River - Burgeo
  - South East Bight - Petite Forte
  - Little Bay Islands - Long Island - Pilley's Island

- The Bell Island service was excluded from schedule reductions implemented as part of the Government Renewal Initiative, as TW was in the process of developing a new schedule to be implemented upon the entry of the MV Legionnaire into service. Since the MV Legionnaire entered service, however, TW has reduced the number of trips on the Bell Island service by 5 round-trips per week from Monday to Friday, and has further reduced the schedule on Saturdays and Sundays to allow for vessel maintenance time, thereby eliminating all scheduled overtime due to call-outs.

- The Fogo Island/Change Islands schedule was not reduced as part of the Government Renewal Initiative. In the case of Fogo Island/Change Islands, one additional round-trip per week was actually added to the Winter schedule, to be consistent with the Summer schedule for this service.
Since that time, it has been determined that the additional round-trip, which costs approximately $250,000 per year in overtime due to the crew call-outs required, is underutilized. On average, this trip carries 15.3 passengers and 7.5 vehicles per trip. The capacity of the MV Veteran is 200 passengers and 64 vehicles. This represents 7.6% of the vessel’s passenger capacity and 11.7% of the vessel’s vehicle capacity.
$6M ferry service for 114 people: But don't mention resettlement on St. Brendan's

Island residents say they would rather 'die with dignity' than uproot

By Terry Roberts, CBC News Posted: Oct 30, 2017 7:00 AM NT Last Updated: Oct 30, 2017 7:00 AM NT


It's late afternoon as the Grace Sparkes approaches the dock, her captain expertly spinning the 43-metre passenger and vehicle ferry around and placing the stern to the wharf.

Another successful hour-long crossing from Burnside for an impressive vessel christened just six years ago, at a cost to the provincial treasury of nearly $30 million.

Fewer than 10 vehicles disembark and in convoy-like fashion, climb the gravel road out of Penny's Cove and disappear over the hill.

Free of her burden, the Grace Sparkes floats snug to the wharf, her diesels idling, her ramp extended, ready to ingest another load and do it all over again in about a half-hour.

This time, there is just one vehicle and two passengers in the lineup.

Nearly $42,000 per resident

Welcome to St. Brendan's, an island community on the Easport Peninsula, in Bonavista Bay, home to Newfoundland and Labrador's most expensive ferry service, by a nautical mile.

The provincial government says it cost more than $6 million to operate this service in 2016, with a per-resident cost of $42,000 and a taxpayer subsidy rate of 93.3 per cent.

The per-resident cost was based on the 2016 census, which put the population of St. Brendan's at 145 souls.
But that number has slipped over the past year.

In October, 114 people called St. Brendan's home, a fact confirmed by residents who routinely do their own head count.

That would drive the annual per-resident cost of the ferry to nearly $53,000, which is two and a half times more expensive than the next closest run.

"I'd hate to be the person that had to keep the books," says Kevin O'Reilly, sounding almost apologetic, while standing dockside.

O'Reilly is chair of the St. Brendan's ferry users committee. He's also deputy mayor, a retired teacher, and like many here, intensely proud of his island home.

He's uncomfortable in front of a camera, and the topic doesn't help.

"I don't know what you're going to do with us all. You gonna chisel us off and leave the Avalon?" he asks.

**Province at edge of financial cliff**

The cost of the ferry, the sprawling all-grade school with its nine students, nearly nine kilometres of provincial roads, the health clinic — and more.

It's a touchy subject here, and few want the issue in the spotlight.

But in a province that some say is at the edge of a financial cliff, this ferry service stands out. Two crews of nine, half-a-million litres of fuel, and at so-called "marine prices," even the smallest replacement parts can reach into the thousands — all serving a population that wouldn't fill two school buses.

O'Reilly and his committee have fought hard for it, and they've heard the grumblings from non-residents.

But this is their highway, their right as citizens, they say.

"Should I have to defend that? That I want to live here? I don't know any other place to live. It crosses my mind lots. Where would I go? Don't know," says O'Reilly.

**Fight to the last breath**

The province is trying to bring down the cost. Trips have been reduced from five to three and engines throttled back to save fuel.

But locals don't like it. They say it hurts tourism, and makes it harder for the dozen or so fishing crews to get their landings into the marketplace.
"I will fight for this community. I will fight [with] every breath that's in me," says the pull-no-punches mayor of St. Brendan’s, Veronica Broomfield.

When approached about this story, Broomfield asks, "Are you trying to kill my community?"

The answer is "no," and Broomfield reluctantly agrees to an interview.

Her tone? Iron-rod stiff.

"I'm not worried about what it costs people to live in Burnside. Or what it costs the people to live in St. John's. So why are they worried about us? I'm too busy during the day to even think about how other people live. And I think they should do the same," she says.

Too big, too much money

The round-trip cost for two passengers and a vehicle on the St. Brendan's ferry is $34. But the actual cost to taxpayers? Nearly $500.

Some residents, including fisherman Paddy Kelly, acknowledge it's just too much.

"A lot of people thought it was a good thing to get this big ferry. But I said to my brother when I saw it the first time. I said, 'I think that's a nail in the coffin for St. Brendan's. Too big. Too much money.'"

No one wants to pay more, and with the population dropping fast, the per-resident cost is going nowhere but up.

Do the options include resettlement?

Be careful what you say.

"Don't mention the word, or someone will have you in the freezer for lobster bait next spring," O'Reilly says, and it's not clear if he's joking.

"I came here 44 years ago, and settled here," adds Mayor Broomfield. "And I was told 44 years ago St. Brendan's might last five years. It's still going strong. And I love every minute of it."

Resettlement is not an option for Paddy Kelly, either.

People on St. Brendan's own their own homes. Life is simple, safe, quiet, the Catholic church at the centre of their lives.

"You make someone leave St. Brendan's that owns their own home and put them in a basement apartment in St. John's or Corner Brook or Gander, I don't know how
happy they are going to be," says Kelly.

**An exodus of people**

But just how strong is St. Brendan's?

The numbers don't lie, and they paint a grim picture.

A young mother and her three school-aged children have plans to leave in November, slashing the school's population by one-third to just six students.

A young couple and their two preschool children left in recent days, heading for better opportunities in Alberta.

Even the school principal, a passionate defender of rural Newfoundland and Labrador, plans to leave with her young daughter in the near future after 10 years on the island.

**Dying with dignity**

Ruby Kean will also join that exodus.

She owns St. Brendan's Convenience, one of two stores on the island.

After 14 years behind the counter, she now measures her future in business in months as opposed to years.

The doors swing open less and less, and many residents stock up during trips off the island.

She walks past her parents' house during her regular strolls around the cove. The heat is still on in the small bungalow, energized by the constantly droning diesel plant just metres away. But the house is empty. Her parents are both deceased.

Kean is exploring new opportunities, away from her beloved island.

"I wish some nights ... I talk to my sisters in St. John's and they're going for coffee together or they're doing this. I think to myself, I wish I was with them," she says.

So will she migrate to the city, like so many others?


The pricey ferry service is busy taking people away from the island these days, far away from a community that has existed for 175 years.

No one denies the future is bleak, including Kevin O'Reilly.
"We're dying. I have no illusions about that. We're hoping to die with dignity."

**Brian Scott**  
Director of Communications  
Transportation and Works  
Government of Newfoundland and Labrador  
e: brianscott@gov.nl.ca  
t: 709.729.3015  
www.tw.gov.nl.ca | @TW_GovNL