

COR/2019/03428

August 9, 2019

Dear Applicant:

Re: Your request for access to information under Part II of the *Access to Information and Protection of Privacy Act* (Our File #: TW/095/2019)

On July 8, 2019, the Department of Transportation and Works received your request for access to the following records:

Any briefing notes, documents, reports, emails relating to the privatization of air ambulances services.

Note: wording updated to "Report/PowerPoint re privatization of air ambulances services created in 2018-19 and its supporting records"

Please be advised a decision has been made by the Deputy Minister for Transportation and Works to refuse access to the requested information. Access has been refused in accordance with the following exceptions to disclosure, as specified in the Access to Information and Protection of Privacy Act (the Act):

Please note all records have been withheld in their entirety under:

subsection 35(1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information which could reasonably be expected to disclose

- (c) plans that relate to the management of personnel of or the administration of a public body and that have not yet been implemented or made public;*
- (d) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to result in the premature disclosure of a proposal or project or in significant loss or gain to a third party;*
- (f) positions, plans, procedures, criteria or instructions developed for the purpose of contractual or other negotiations by or on behalf of the government of the province or a public body, or considerations which relate to those negotiations;*
- (g) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to prejudice the financial or economic interest of the government of the province or a public body.*

subsection 29(1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information that would reveal

- (a) advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options developed by or for a public body or minister.*

Please note there are also partial redactions throughout these records under:

subsection 38(1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information that would reveal
(b) labour relations information the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to (i) harm the competitive position of the public body as an employer or interfere with the negotiating position of the public body as an employer.

subsection 40(1) The head of a public body shall refuse to disclose personal information to an applicant where the disclosure would be an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy.

Please be advised that you may appeal this decision and ask the Information and Privacy Commissioner to review the decision to deny access to the requested information, as set out in section 42 of the *Act* (a copy of this section of the *Act* has been enclosed for your reference). A request to the Commissioner must be made in writing within 15 business days of the date of this letter or within a longer period that may be allowed by the Commissioner. Your appeal should identify your concerns with the request and why you are submitting the appeal.

The appeal may be addressed to the Information and Privacy Commissioner is as follows:

Office of the Information and Privacy Commissioner
2 Canada Drive
P. O. Box 13004, Stn. A
St. John's, NL. A1B 3V8
Telephone: (709) 729-6309
Toll-Free: 1-877-729-6309
Facsimile: (709) 729-6500

You may also appeal directly to the Supreme Court Trial Division within 15 business days after you receive the decision of the public body, pursuant to section 52 of the *Act* (a copy of this section of the *Act* has been enclosed for your reference).

Please be advised that this letter will be published following a 72 hour period after it is sent electronically to you, or five business days in the case where records are mailed to you. It is the goal to have the letter posted to the Completed Access to Information Requests website within one business day following the applicable period of time. Please note that requests for personal information will not be posted online.

If you have any further questions, please contact me by telephone at 709-729-5351 or by email at ATTW@gov.nl.ca.

Sincerely,



Angela McIntyre
ATIPP Coordinator

Policy advice or recommendations

29. (1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information that would reveal

(a) advice, proposals, recommendations, analyses or policy options developed by or for a public body or minister;

(b) the contents of a formal research report or audit report that in the opinion of the head of the public body is incomplete and in respect of which a request or order for completion has been made by the head within 65 business days of delivery of the report; or

(c) draft legislation or regulations.

(2) The head of a public body shall not refuse to disclose under subsection (1)

(a) factual material;

(b) a public opinion poll;

(c) a statistical survey;

(d) an appraisal;

(e) an environmental impact statement or similar information;

(f) a final report or final audit on the performance or efficiency of a public body or on any of its programs or policies;

(g) a consumer test report or a report of a test carried out on a product to test equipment of the public body;

(h) a feasibility or technical study, including a cost estimate, relating to a policy or project of the public body;

(i) a report on the results of field research undertaken before a policy proposal is formulated;

(j) a report of an external task force, committee, council or similar body that has been established to consider a matter and make a report or recommendations to a public body;

(k) a plan or proposal to establish a new program or to change a program, if the plan or proposal has been approved or rejected by the head of the public body;

(l) information that the head of the public body has cited publicly as the basis for making a decision or formulating a policy; or

(m) a decision, including reasons, that is made in the exercise of a discretionary power or an adjudicative function and that affects the rights of the applicant.

(3) Subsection (1) does not apply to information in a record that has been in existence for 15 years or more.

Disclosure harmful to the financial or economic interests of a public body

35. (1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information which could reasonably be expected to disclose

- (a) trade secrets of a public body or the government of the province;
- (b) financial, commercial, scientific or technical information that belongs to a public body or to the government of the province and that has, or is reasonably likely to have, monetary value;
- (c) plans that relate to the management of personnel of or the administration of a public body and that have not yet been implemented or made public;
- (d) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to result in the premature disclosure of a proposal or project or in significant loss or gain to a third party;
- (e) scientific or technical information obtained through research by an employee of a public body, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to deprive the employee of priority of publication;
- (f) positions, plans, procedures, criteria or instructions developed for the purpose of contractual or other negotiations by or on behalf of the government of the province or a public body, or considerations which relate to those negotiations;
- (g) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to prejudice the financial or economic interest of the government of the province or a public body; or
- (h) information, the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to be injurious to the ability of the government of the province to manage the economy of the province.

(2) The head of a public body shall not refuse to disclose under subsection (1) the results of product or environmental testing carried out by or for that public body, unless the testing was done

(a) for a fee as a service to a person or a group of persons other than the public body;
or

(b) for the purpose of developing methods of testing.

Disclosure harmful to labour relations interests of public body as employer

38. (1) The head of a public body may refuse to disclose to an applicant information that would reveal

(a) labour relations information of the public body as an employer that is prepared or supplied, implicitly or explicitly, in confidence, and is treated consistently as confidential information by the public body as an employer; or

(b) labour relations information the disclosure of which could reasonably be expected to

(i) harm the competitive position of the public body as an employer or interfere with the negotiating position of the public body as an employer,

(ii) result in significant financial loss or gain to the public body as an employer, or

(iii) reveal information supplied to, or the report of, an arbitrator, mediator, labour relations officer, staff relations specialist or other person or body appointed to resolve or inquire into a labour relations dispute, including information or records prepared by or for the public body in contemplation of litigation or arbitration or in contemplation of a settlement offer.

(2) Subsection (1) does not apply where the information is in a record that is in the custody or control of the Provincial Archives of Newfoundland and Labrador or the archives of a public body and that has been in existence for 50 years or more.

Disclosure harmful to personal privacy

40. (1) The head of a public body shall refuse to disclose personal information to an applicant where the disclosure would be an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy.

(2) A disclosure of personal information is not an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy where

- (a) the applicant is the individual to whom the information relates;
- (b) the third party to whom the information relates has, in writing, consented to or requested the disclosure;
- (c) there are compelling circumstances affecting a person's health or safety and notice of disclosure is given in the form appropriate in the circumstances to the third party to whom the information relates;
- (d) an Act or regulation of the province or of Canada authorizes the disclosure;
- (e) the disclosure is for a research or statistical purpose and is in accordance with section 70;
- (f) the information is about a third party's position, functions or remuneration as an officer, employee or member of a public body or as a member of a minister's staff;
- (g) the disclosure reveals financial and other details of a contract to supply goods or services to a public body;
- (h) the disclosure reveals the opinions or views of a third party given in the course of performing services for a public body, except where they are given in respect of another individual;
- (i) public access to the information is provided under the *Financial Administration Act* ;
- (j) the information is about expenses incurred by a third party while travelling at the expense of a public body;
- (k) the disclosure reveals details of a licence, permit or a similar discretionary benefit granted to a third party by a public body, not including personal information supplied in support of the application for the benefit;
- (l) the disclosure reveals details of a discretionary benefit of a financial nature granted to a third party by a public body, not including

- (i) personal information that is supplied in support of the application for the benefit, or
 - (ii) personal information that relates to eligibility for income and employment support under the *Income and Employment Support Act* or to the determination of income or employment support levels; or
- (m) the disclosure is not contrary to the public interest as described in subsection (3) and reveals only the following personal information about a third party:
- (i) attendance at or participation in a public event or activity related to a public body, including a graduation ceremony, sporting event, cultural program or club, or field trip, or
 - (ii) receipt of an honour or award granted by or through a public body.
- (3) The disclosure of personal information under paragraph (2)(m) is an unreasonable invasion of personal privacy where the third party whom the information is about has requested that the information not be disclosed.
- (4) A disclosure of personal information is presumed to be an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy where
- (a) the personal information relates to a medical, psychiatric or psychological history, diagnosis, condition, treatment or evaluation;
 - (b) the personal information is an identifiable part of a law enforcement record, except to the extent that the disclosure is necessary to dispose of the law enforcement matter or to continue an investigation;
 - (c) the personal information relates to employment or educational history;
 - (d) the personal information was collected on a tax return or gathered for the purpose of collecting a tax;
 - (e) the personal information consists of an individual's bank account information or credit card information;
 - (f) the personal information consists of personal recommendations or evaluations, character references or personnel evaluations;
 - (g) the personal information consists of the third party's name where
 - (i) it appears with other personal information about the third party, or

(ii) the disclosure of the name itself would reveal personal information about the third party; or

(h) the personal information indicates the third party's racial or ethnic origin or religious or political beliefs or associations.

(5) In determining under subsections (1) and (4) whether a disclosure of personal information constitutes an unreasonable invasion of a third party's personal privacy, the head of a public body shall consider all the relevant circumstances, including whether

(a) the disclosure is desirable for the purpose of subjecting the activities of the province or a public body to public scrutiny;

(b) the disclosure is likely to promote public health and safety or the protection of the environment;

(c) the personal information is relevant to a fair determination of the applicant's rights;

(d) the disclosure will assist in researching or validating the claims, disputes or grievances of aboriginal people;

(e) the third party will be exposed unfairly to financial or other harm;

(f) the personal information has been supplied in confidence;

(g) the personal information is likely to be inaccurate or unreliable;

(h) the disclosure may unfairly damage the reputation of a person referred to in the record requested by the applicant;

(i) the personal information was originally provided to the applicant; and

(j) the information is about a deceased person and, if so, whether the length of time the person has been deceased indicates the disclosure is not an unreasonable invasion of the deceased person's personal privacy.

Access or correction complaint

42. (1) A person who makes a request under this Act for access to a record or for correction of personal information may file a complaint with the commissioner respecting a decision, act or failure to act of the head of the public body that relates to the request.

(2) A complaint under subsection (1) shall be filed in writing not later than 15 business days

(a) after the applicant is notified of the decision of the head of the public body, or the date of the act or failure to act; or

(b) after the date the head of the public body is considered to have refused the request under subsection 16 (2).

(3) A third party informed under section 19 of a decision of the head of a public body to grant access to a record or part of a record in response to a request may file a complaint with the commissioner respecting that decision.

(4) A complaint under subsection (3) shall be filed in writing not later than 15 business days after the third party is informed of the decision of the head of the public body.

(5) The commissioner may allow a longer time period for the filing of a complaint under this section.

(6) A person or third party who has appealed directly to the Trial Division under subsection 52 (1) or 53 (1) shall not file a complaint with the commissioner.

(7) The commissioner shall refuse to investigate a complaint where an appeal has been commenced in the Trial Division.

(8) A complaint shall not be filed under this section with respect to

(a) a request that is disregarded under section 21 ;

(b) a decision respecting an extension of time under section 23 ;

(c) a variation of a procedure under section 24 ; or

(d) an estimate of costs or a decision not to waive a cost under section 26 .

(9) The commissioner shall provide a copy of the complaint to the head of the public body concerned.

Direct appeal to Trial Division by an applicant

52. (1) Where an applicant has made a request to a public body for access to a record or correction of personal information and has not filed a complaint with the commissioner under section 42, the applicant may appeal the decision, act or failure to act of the head of the public body that relates to the request directly to the Trial Division.

(2) An appeal shall be commenced under subsection (1) not later than 15 business days

(a) after the applicant is notified of the decision of the head of the public body, or the date of the act or failure to act; or

(b) after the date the head of the public body is considered to have refused the request under subsection 16 (2).

(3) Where an applicant has filed a complaint with the commissioner under section 42 and the commissioner has refused to investigate the complaint, the applicant may commence an appeal in the Trial Division of the decision, act or failure to act of the head of the public body that relates to the request for access to a record or for correction of personal information.

(4) An appeal shall be commenced under subsection (3) not later than 15 business days after the applicant